

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE THIRD CIRCUIT

---

No. 15-3736

---

BEN ROBINSON; MAXINE ROBINSON,  
Appellants

v.

FAMILY DOLLAR INC; CHARLES RAMSEY, Individually and in his official capacity  
as Commissioner of the Philadelphia Police Department; CITY OF PHILADELPHIA,  
doing business as Philadelphia Police Department; JOHN DOES 1-10;  
FAMILY DOLLAR STORES OF PENNSYLVANIA INC, D/B/A Family Dollar Inc;  
BRAHEEM WILKINS, D/B/A Family Dollar, Inc. & Family Dollar Stores of  
Pennsylvania, Inc.; WILFRID ETIENNE, Individually and in his official capacity as  
police officer in the Philadelphia Police Department

---

On Appeal from the United States District Court  
for the Eastern District of Pennsylvania  
(E.D. Pa. No. 2-14-cv-03189)  
Honorable Gerald J. Pappert, U.S. District Judge

---

Submitted Pursuant to Third Circuit L.A.R. 34.1(a)  
September 30, 2016

Before: AMBRO, SMITH,\* and FISHER,\* *Circuit Judges.*

---

JUDGMENT

---

---

\* Honorable D. Brooks Smith, United States Circuit Judge for the Third Circuit,  
assumed Chief Judge status on October 1, 2016.

\* Honorable D. Michael Fisher, United States Circuit Judge for the Third Circuit,  
assumed senior status on February 1, 2017.

This cause came on to be considered on the record from the United States District Court for the Eastern District of Pennsylvania and was submitted pursuant to Third Circuit LAR 34.1(a) on September 30, 2016. On consideration whereof, it is now hereby

ORDERED and ADJUDGED by this Court that the order of the District Court entered November 3, 2015, be and the same is hereby AFFIRMED. All of the above in accordance with the opinion of this Court.

Costs shall not be taxed.

ATTEST:

s/Marcia M. Waldron  
Clerk

Dated: February 9, 2017

The seal of the United States Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit is circular. It features an eagle with spread wings perched on a shield. The shield is divided into sections, with a constellation of stars in the upper left. The words "UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE THIRD CIRCUIT" are inscribed around the perimeter of the seal.  
Certified as a true copy and issued in lieu  
of a formal mandate on March 3, 2017

Teste: *Marcia M. Waldron*  
Clerk, U.S. Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit